

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Meeting Minutes

Date: December 8, 2021

Location: Zoom Teleconference

Called to order: 1:30 p.m.

Commissioners present: Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting: Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Commissioners absent: Emily Bahr, Ayo Love

I. Minutes of the November 3, 2021 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King

Opposed:

Comments:

II. Landmark nomination of 2500-2502 First Street

Motion: Nominate 2500-2502 First Street for study as an individually-designated Landmark.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Lee Bressler

Third: Stephanie Bruno

Result: Passed

Comments:

III. Review and Adoption of 2022 Meeting Dates and Deadlines

Motion: Adopt the 2022 meeting dates and deadlines as presented.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Stephanie Bruno

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno

Opposed:

Comments:

IV. Revision to Rules, Policies and Procedures, Section II.B., Architectural Review Committee Membership

Motion: Approve the revisions to the rules, policies, and procedures as presented.

By: Ed de Montluzin

Second: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno

Opposed:

Comments:

V. Consent Agenda

Motion: Suspend the rules and move 1531 Governor Nicholls Street from the consent agenda to the regular agenda.

By:

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments:

Motion: Approve the Consent Agenda

By: Jennie West

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

VI. New Business Work Applications

A. 1531 Governor Nicholls St

Application: Renovation and two-story addition at a two-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Defer the application to the next ARC meeting to allow neighbors to voice their concerns and for the ARC to revisit the massing and roof deck at the new addition.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments: Several neighbors voiced their concerns about the massing and roof deck at the new addition.

B. 2001 Iberville St

Application: Request to remove existing historic iron fence for installation of new fencing on a Landmark site.

Motion: The existing fencing should be retained, but it can be modified and reused to create one consistent run across the front of the property, as well as being raised on an 18" masonry chainwall. New, taller HDLC-compliant metal fencing can be added at the side and rear property lines.

By: Annie Cambria

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 538-40 Marigny St

Application: Request to install visually prominent roof-mounted generator equipment on a contributing one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the request to install visually prominent roof-mounted generator equipment with the

proviso that the owner provide substantiation for the need of the generator based on medical necessity and a confirmation of the proposed weekly test schedule.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Stephanie Bruno

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 3929 Chartres St

Application: Installation of visually prominent solar panel equipment at two-story single-family residential building.

Motion: Approval of application for the installation of solar panels.

By: Jennie West

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 808 Opelousas Ave

Application: Remove existing asphalt shingles roof and ridge tiles on two-story two-family residential building and install a standing seam metal roof.

Motion: Approval of application to install metal roofing and remove existing ridge tiles.

By: Heather Szapary

Second: Jennie West

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

F. 1325 St Mary St

Application: Remove historic iron fencing and install new decorative fencing with brick and concrete chain wall.

Motion: Approve modification of the existing iron fencing to match the style of the more decorative fence on the right and to accommodate the new driveway gate; however, the two separate pedestrian gates must remain instead of one center gate. The height of the fence may also be increased by adding a low masonry chain wall.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Lee Bressler

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

G. 5339 St Charles Ave

Application: Request to remove existing English-V ridge tiles to replace deteriorated asbestos shingle roof damaged during Hurricane Ida with new standing seam metal roofing on a contributing two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the request to remove the existing roof ridge tiles to install a new standing seam metal roof

in a less reflective finish, such as natural bronze.

By: Ed de Montluzin

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

H. 7431-33 St Charles Ave

Application: Request to remove existing terra-cotta tile roof damaged during Hurricane Ida from rear non-street facing elevation of building and replacement with new architectural grade asphalt shingle roof on an existing contributing two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the limited terra-cotta roof tile removal from the rear gable roof extension only for replacement with new architectural grade asphalt fiberglass shingles, as outlined in Option 1. Additionally, the Commission agreed that if the applicant can demonstrate this area of roof alone would not be sufficient to harvest the required roof tiles, the removal and replacement of all the roof tiles beyond the line of the second roof ridge, as outlined in Option 2 can be approved at the Staff level.

By: Ed de Montluzin

Second: Lee Bressler

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

I. 3210 Burgundy St

Application: Installation of visually prominent solar panel equipment at two-story, mixed-use building.

Motion: Approval of application for installation of solar panel equipment.

By: Jennie West

Second: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

J. 330 Belleville St

Application: Removal of existing shingle roof and ridge tiles and installation of standing seam metal roof on two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Approval of application to install standing seam on main roof and porch roof with removal of ridge tiles.

By: Heather Szapary

Second: Stephanie Bruno

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

IV. New Business Demolition Applications

A. 1414 Kerlerrec St

Application: Demolition of contributing, one-story, single-family residential building to grade.
Motion: Approve the demolition with the proviso to salvage any historic materials that can be donated.
By: Stephanie Bruno
Second: Donna Wakeman
Result: Passed
In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West
Opposed:
Comments:

B. 5427 Dauphine St

Application: Demolition of existing contributing one-story, single-family raised basement residential building to grade for a vacant lot.
Motion: Deny the application for demolition to grade because despite the building being in poor condition, it continues to contribute its original style, type, scale, massing, footprint, and roof form to the tout ensemble of the surrounding historic district and because the HDLC Design Guidelines do not support the demolition of contributing rated structures for the purpose of maintaining a vacant lot.
By: Calvin Alexander
Second: Donna Wakeman
Result: Passed
In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West
Opposed:
Comments:

C. 3429 Willow St

Application: Demolition of existing contributing one-story, single-family residential building to grade.
Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade.
By: Stephanie Bruno
Second: Jason King
Result: Passed
In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West
Opposed:
Comments:

D. 8525 Jeannette St

Application: Demolition of a contributing one-story single-family residential building.
Motion: Approval of application for demolition
By: Jennie West
Second: Heather Szapary
Result: Passed
In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West
Opposed:
Comments:

E. 3718 Constance St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof structure of an existing contributing one-story, two-family residential building for a camelback addition.
Motion: Approve the application for partial roof demolition.
By: Stephanie Bruno
Second: Jennie West
Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

F. 1240 Seventh St

Application: Demolition of existing non-contributing two-story, single-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Defer action on this application until such time as the Architectural Review Committee conceptually approves the application(s) for new construction.

By: Anne Redd

Second: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

G. 3923 Carondelet St

Application: Demolition of existing non-contributing, one-story commercial building to grade.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade.

By: Jennie West

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

V. Old Business Retention Applications

A. 2730 N Rampart St

Application: Retention of removal of five (5) chimneys from existing contributing one-story, two-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the request for retention of removal of five chimneys from the building based on the HDLC inspection which confirmed the remaining portions of chimney at the interior are not structurally sufficient for re-building new exterior chimneys above the roof line.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Jennie West

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

VI. New Business Retention Applications

A. 3112 Marais St

Application: Retention of inappropriate windows installed at side elevation of two-story multi-family residential building.

Motion: Approval of application for retention of three (3) inappropriate left side elevation windows and denial of retention of three (3) inappropriate right side elevation windows.

By: Jennie West

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 7475 Garfield St

Application: Retention of demolition beyond the scope of proposed work at a one-story single-family residential building.

Motion: Approval of application of retention of demolition beyond proposed scope.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 805-07 Mandeville St

Application: Retention of rear walls, decking, awning, and staircase installed on contributing one-story, two-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the request for retention of the small rear gable window due to its very limited visibility and to deny the request for retention for all other items in violation at the rear of the building because the previous ARC, Commission and Staff recommendations and approved work were not followed.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Jennie West

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

VII. Ratification of Architectural Committee and Staff Actions since the Wednesday, November 3, 2021 Meeting.

Motion: Approval

By: Greg Hackenburg

Second: Lee Bressler

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Anne Redd, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments: